Vidding Evolution:
Community Change Among
Amateur Fan Video Makers

Lynn Cherny (with a lot of help from the vidding community and friends)
April 29, 2010 for HCI Seminar at UIUC
WARNING: VIDEO CONTENT MAY BE DISTURBING.

Flashing lights / strobe, homo-erotic content, violence and gore
My position

I am a fan & a vidder, since 1993. (& I don’t make money off research or publishing.)

I’m not “neutral.”
I like hanging out with other women, talking about it.

TV is important to me and a lot of my friends.
Why (else) is this important?

- Our history is at risk: lost or rewritten. (Coppa’s “since the dawn of YouTube...”)

The story is somewhat unusual: Women playing with technology, from pre-to-post Internet.

- There are legal threats – academics and scholars can and do help.

- There are technology needs here – participatory design? Open source tools.
Video editing tool development

Open source and collective activism

Remix / mashup / transmedia / participatory culture buzzwords

Lens of Gender & Technology

Deviant psychology

Community evolution (pre and post Internet)

Folk / Vernacular art and critique

Policy and legality aspects of remix culture

Annotation post-talk: “deviant psychology” is a joke here. This was about lenses of research possible on this topic.
My Ongoing Research

- Surveys on fan community sites (LJ, DW, other) 100+ responses, follow up survey to ~60%

- Informal qualitative research at con, email (and my own historical perspective – I started vidding in 1993ish on VCRs)

- Online sources: Fanlore and other fannish resources, Organization of Transformative Works, community mining on LJ/DW

A few previous vidding links/works...

Camille Bacon-Smith, **Enterprising Women** (ethnography of media fandom)

Henry Jenkins

**Textual Poachers** et al. (participatory culture, transmedia, remix...)

“How to Watch a Fan Vid”

http://www.henryjenkins.org/2006/09/how_to_watch_a_fanvid.html

Francesca Coppa interviewed in Reason.com, 2008

http://reason.com/archives/2008/07/18/remixing-television

Vidder Luminosity in NY Magazine: (twice)

http://nymag.com/movies/features/videos/40622/

DIY Video 24x7 Conference – Vidding session curated by Laura Shapiro and Francesca Coppa:  http://www.video24-7.org/video/vidding.html

Fannish history on the fanlore wiki:  http://fanlore.org/wiki/Vidding


Related:
Mimi Ito’s work on AMV –
   Closing plenary at CSCW2010
   First Monday article on AMV now out:
   http://www.uic.edu/htbin/cgiwrap/bin/ojs/index.php/fm/article/view/2968/2528

First Monday issue on digital music sharing and the Internet, July 2005
Our Projects

Archive of Our Own
The Archive of Our Own offers a noncommercial and nonprofit central hosting place for fanfiction and other transformative fanworks, using open-source archiving software.

Fanlore
Fanlore, a fandom wiki, is devoted to preserving the history of transformative fanworks and the fandoms from which they have arisen.

Legal Advocacy
OTW is committed to protecting and defending fanworks from commercial exploitation and legal challenge.

Open Doors
Open Doors offers shelter to at-risk fannish projects. Subprojects include the Fan Culture Preservation Project, which preserves fanzines and other non-digital forms of fan culture, and the GeoCities Rescue Project.

Transformative Works and Cultures
TWC is a peer-reviewed academic journal that seeks to promote scholarship on fanworks and practices.

Vidding History
The Vidding History project is committed to documenting and celebrating the 35 year history of fan vidding.
What is “Vidding?”

Creation of music videos (“vids”) using “found footage” from television shows and movies (occasionally other sources) set to a “borrowed” song track, to create an emotional or story effect.

An activity of “media fandom” stretching back to Trek of the 1970ies.
Who Are Vidders?

- **Women**
  - 90% – male responses mostly due to Anime editor responses (with at least 2 exceptions)
- **Age 21 - 50 (not teens!)**
- **Mainly in North America**
  - but increasing diversity – UK, FR, NZ...
- **Professionally:** ~70% employed
  - law, IT / computer industry, graphic design, retail, students or university staff, technical or freelance writers....

Point was partly that AMV editors are very different demographics, and may also start younger, Ito found.
"Age" of the art in the current sample

VCR phasing out...
SOME HISTORY – PRE-INTERNET.
VCR method: 1980ies and 90ies

Master: Recording

Slave: Playing machine
Tape
“Management”
Tape quality packaging, pre-DVD:
Media Fandom Community

- **Jurassic Pre-Internet:** APAs, cons. Pros library circulated by mail.
- **Internet era (1990ies):** Mailing lists like virgule and blake’s 7 lists. USENET for trek fans. Still cons!
- **2008ish+ Now:** Dreamwidth (fan-friendlier) and OTW’s open source archive (AO3) and agenda. Yes, there are still cons.

Vidding Parallel History

- **198ies and early 1990ies:** Vidding was done with fragile tapes, and con shows. “Rainbow Noise” zine for vidding.
- **1980ish:** MediaWest vid show’s discouragement of slash fuels slash con shows… like Zcon’s
- **1991:** Escapade (and Zcon and Virgule) fuel separate genetic branch of vidding.
- **1994?** First computer vid by T’Rhys
- **2002:** Vividcon starts
- **2003:** Vids start going online.
- **2010:** OTW trying to raise money for servers for vidding archives now due to too many streaming site takedowns

This may be incorrect in some details – I whizzed past it to the next cutout points.
Key points here:

Media fandom cons and vids lived hand-in-hand. Much later, the internet happened.

MediaWest Con didn’t like slash vids, but some of us did. And we made a lot (early 1990ies).

Vidding went digital in late 90ies.
Brief intro to idea of “Slash”
Example VCR vids

“Too Long a Soldier” (Deejay) – made use of external news/war footage [Character focus]

“Nights in White Satin” (Tash and Lynn/me) – audio editing, with a specific scene now lost forever from the official record. [“Slash” practically canonical, commented on in press. DVDs released do NOT have this music that we used in the show, so vid/tapes are only record now of what was so amazing at the time.]

“Us” (Media Cannibals) – classic “slash” vid (remastered on computer by another fan, Killa)

What was I up to here....

Deejay did something experimental at the time, to make a more “realistic” look at Bodie’s past. Also, note the sync of the dancing protesters with the music – a point that was important in “Marble House” and others later. External (esp. documentary footage) rarely if ever done in VCR vids, arguably increasing in practice now. No, I doubt the current vidders were influenced from this, but it’s interesting to see how often “nothing is really new.”

Tash and I used a scene with a meta comment – “how are you going to remember this” that I wanted to show in contrast to the Hard Sun vid later. Plus, the sadness of that scene being gone forever from the official DVDs.

“Us” is a classic, with an actual moment of lip sync during VCR vidding – a characteristic feature of AMV vids.
“LiveJournal's small network cluster is shown in the image as cluster #3. The others are (1) DailyKOS, (2) BoingBoing, (4) other political bloggers, (5) porn, and (6) sports fans. LiveJournal is further out than the porn fans, but bigger! Smaller than sports fans, though.”

http://www.ghostweather.com/blog/labels/socialstudies.html
Vidders’ Current Tech Usage

Let them tell you about it... [clip from fan vidding history series at OTW]

Nonlinear Editing common tools

Adobe Premiere Pro, Sony Vegas, After Effects, Final Cut, Ulead, Windows Movie Maker...

Point here was how much easier it is to sync to the beat, and how many clips there are to handle
“... there's a lot more "feral" vidders, people who have picked it up on their own instead of through mentoring and following the vidding "houses." I started vidding just as that changeover was really beginning to happen, I think. Also, the use of tech to change source/mixing/remixing source to make something entirely new has come a long way. ...

(-anon)
Point here was how everyone HATES the clip collection part... the giant V in the chart!
Asset Management of Clips (mine is “a total mess”)

Point here was meta data is not available – like “red” clip, motion from left, etc.
BUT BACK TO THE GOAL...
Motivation

Primary influences:
- A compelling song, a story they want to tell.

“I usually hear a song that I believe will be perfect for a statement I want to make or a story I wish to tell. I am inspired by characters and things that I feel weren't addressed as well as they could have been in the canon.”

-anon

Least influential:
- What their friends are watching and talking about!

Except I added that it’s a very social activity regardless...
Choice of song is critical

Overall arc, frame, positioning

Transitions – juxtaposition, relationships, fades…

Audio editing – get in, get out.

Cutting to the beat and working with the music’s tempo – no “beats on the floor”

Point of View

Literal vs. metaphoric alignments

Color and motion flow

Use of unusual clips - increasingly, external footage.

Tech niggles: logos/bugs, aspect ratios, clip quality
When asked about most surprising genre – some common responses were “slash”, “AU”, “real person slash”
I was trying to make a thread of VCR vidders → earlier digital influentials → current digital influentials.

TWO WELL-KNOWN “EARLY COMPUTER” VIDDERS
Killa

“Dante’s Prayer” (a well-known Trek vid)

“Little Lion Man” (a character/story response)

And another thread – early Killa to later Killa?
The Vidder

Luminosity upgrades fan video.

By Logan Hill Published Nov 12, 2007

Luminosity is the best fan that shows like Friday Night Lights, Highlander, Farscape, and Buffy ever had—but she can’t use her real name in this interview for fear that their producers will sue her. As a vidder—a director of passionate tributes and critiques of her favorite shows—Luminosity samples video in order to remix and reinterpret it, bending source material to her own purposes. “Much of contemporary remix culture falls back on parody,” explains MIT professor Henry Jenkins, author of Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media Collide, “but these fan videos seek to convey the emotional intensity [that they feel]. They communicate more if you know the shows on which they are based but they can stand alone as mood poems or character sketches.” We emailed with Luminosity about her meticulously crafted videos, including Women’s Work, her loving critique of violence in Supernatural, and Vogue/360, her hysterical riff on those hunky Spartans.

I think many of our readers won’t be familiar with “vidding.” Could you tell me what it is? The quick and easy description: Vids are fan-made music videos. We create them using scenes taken from our favorite TV shows and movies, pairing them with a particular piece of music and imposing our own video-editing choices and style. The motivation for a lot of us is to convey something deeply felt about the show.

Most people became aware of vidding with YouTube, but there’s a longer history to it, right? Vidding started in 1975 with Kandy Fong, a Star Trek fan, who made the first ever vid, at a convention, by setting a
Luminosity

Samples: “Ecstatic Drum Trip,” “Women’s Work”

EDT is one of my favs – and it shows some extraordinary fast editing. I didn’t get to WW, but described it.
What are Vids “Like?”

- Music video segments in TV shows (Miami Vice)
- Credit sequences (Dead Zone Credits)
- Movie trailers
- Montages sequences
- Artistic commercials (short narrative, emotional impact)
- Anime Music Video (AMV)

Coincidentally, someone asked if vids were influenced by traditional cinematography practices, right before I got here. I showed DZ credit snippet, and wanted to show how Sandy and I achieved similar effect in our DZ vid “Someone You Might Have Been,” but had to skip that for time.
Most vidders are, however, influenced most by other vidders! (see how social it is)
“Whose vids do you admire?”

Confession: In the talk, these nodes had fan names on them. However, I said I would only report in aggregate. So names are cleaned out here. This came out pretty well-connected, which means people mentioned similar people, except for the fringe of less connected AMV and YouTube vid respondents. Gist is that the 2 big dark nodes were mentioned most frequently – they are of the current crop of active digital vidders. Lighter blue big nodes were early digital vidders still well-known.
There’s something of an “age” effect going on here...

This is now labelled with when they started vidding. The upper right tended to the older VCR/digital crowd and their friends, and the left side is the slightly more recent crowd. I will redo this with all years as labels, but I had more respondents in the survey from the recent years.
More Recent Vidder Profiles

“Seven Nation Army” then Charmax
“Piece of Me” then Obsessive24

http://community.livejournal.com/vid_commentary/

Intent was clips of their vids, then parts of their profiles on vidding_commentary. Had very little time for more than quick snippets.
Now if you notice the gif on the right, that is a section from *Jesus for the Jugular*. It's hard to tell without the music, but what Nicky did was ramp the speed so that the boys, the Hitler Youth, were marching on beat with her song. My song also has a kick ass beat and it just so happens that the particular transition you see came at a moment where I could play with the speed as well. When I was laying everything out in my head, I knew at that moment that this would be my homage to Nicky.
“Marble House,” by Hollywoodgrrrl (features external war footage!)

http://community.livejournal.com/vid_commentary/
Point was about critical viewing – color in SPN – an awesome post
AbsoluteDestiny discusses “Hard Sun,” by bradcpu and Laura Shapiro

More use of external footage, and framing, and critical reading – echoes of “how are you going to remember this?” in “Nights in White Satin”

http://community.livejournal.com/vid_commentary/
Are we all still having fun?

“... In the past several years I've seen, at least in my small corner of vidding, BNFs/movers and shakers have made huge strides toward socio-politicizing fandom, and that means more vids are being made with the goal of being "socially relevant," such as pointing out perceived misogyny and racism in fandom. So, now, if a vidder makes only slash vids, some in the community are labeling them misogynist; and if the slash pair happens to be two white guys, they're also labeled racist.”

One fan response to our evolution, and possibly to the move away from a slash vidding start some of us had. Wanted to show Hot Hot Hot here, but didn’t have time. Boo.
RULES / TABOOS
Risks They/We Face

Copyright Infringement - C&D, TOS violations...
Many vidders say they have been hit by these, but just keep moving their content. Benefits of streaming for instant access to audience outweigh the loss of quality/risks.

“We need to own our own servers.”

“Streaming sites that won’t delete our vids are hard to find. Definitely some legal worries that don’t make me share my vids crazily everywhere.”
Other Controversy

Content itself – internal and external issues for the community:

– Slash
– RPF / RPS
– Fans in vids (meta)
– Incest, children

“I just hope our first legal case is about adults, who aren’t related” [and are fictional, I’d add.]

Example of J2 by Proof Pudding
THREATS/INFLUENCE FROM AMV...
AMV – Anime Music Video

Mostly male (68% in Mimi Ito’s 2007 research)

“They’re all boys, and they’re way ahead of us in their tech”
– vidder friend after an anime con

Have their “own” very sophisticated hosting site with contests, multiple scalar ratings, comments, vid commentary and donations supporting it – Animemusicvideo.org

Top rated there currently:
http://www.youtube.com/user/Chiikaboom#p/a/u/2/ul3SPNIt6tI
2006, Vidding community’s charter said...

“Anime music video fans may feel more at home in amv or ink_vids. We welcome VCR vidders as well.”
2010, LJ’s Vidding charter has changed!

“The vidding Community

If you like fannish music videos (vids, a.k.a songvids, fanvids), this is the place for you. Vidders and vid-watchers are equally welcome -- you don't have to make vids to join, you just have to like them.

Open to all fandoms and all vid genres (slash, het, gen, constructed reality, etc.). Anime fans are welcome, as are VCR vidders.

“Open to all fandoms and all genres (slash, het, gen, constructed reality, etc.). Anime fans are welcome, as are VCR vidders.”
2006 – AMV folks who are connected to vidding comms

This is a leaf-trimmed graph of overlapping “watchers” of vidding, vividcon, the_reel, amv, and fan_vids in 2006.
Vissy was the only person connected to all 5 of the communities in 2006.
In 2010, there are more people connected to all 5 communities.
General changes:

2006 –
1 out degree 5
22 out degree 4

2010 –
4 out degree 5
41 out degree 4

“degree” basically means how many connections
Two AMV-turned vidders

Jescaflowne, “Can Delight”
Profile of AbsoluteDestiny,
by bradcpu

I showed a clip of “Can Delight” specifically because of the effects usage, in heavy contrast to previously shown vid examples.
Funny “Anime Vids for Media Fans”

(http://thefourthvine.dreamwidth.org/52266.html)

“Anime vidders are like magpies: very drawn to the shiny. They like bright colors and flashing frames and scenes where 18 characters from different fandoms do the funky chicken. After a while, you'll like it, too. Or you'll have an epileptic seizure. One or the other.”
Some Differences Perceived by Vidders...

“But in general, I've noticed that the newer generation of AMV editors tend to focus too much on fluff and effects, rather than being actual fans of the shows that they watch. They emphasize the editing/effects/techniques of the process rather than the sources that were used. I'd rather people are more focused on being a fan of the media, rather than being a fan of the process.”

“AMV vidders tend to have an awesome grasp of special effects. Live action vidders tend to focus more on how the story relates to the song. Some of the best vidders I've know have been both AMV vidders and Live action vidders at some point.”

“AMVers could learn about talking about meaning and feelings :)

“There is a lot more cross-pollination than there used to be. I think AMV has made vidders more aware of visual aesthetics.”
“Visibility and diversity are the main changes since I started in 2005. A seemingly small, female, experienced and well-defined but hidden community with some but not large amounts of experimentation beyond the usual aesthetics went through a massive shift - what was a community with great depth but not much breadth went, in a period basically between the start of Buffy and the start of BSG, to a community that was experimenting with all kinds of narratives, approaches and awareness. Very exciting but challenging times as the increase in scope causes concerns in the more conservative and older communities about loss of identity.”
“The first gen seems to have been a pretty tight knit community where everyone sort of knew or knew of the others. 

Now, it seems like there are TONS of new, young vidders that are just saturating the fandoms so much so that the idea of a central/encompassing group seems impossible. Vidding seems like more of a solo act these days, rather than a community one.”
Wrapping up....

CHALLENGES, SOCIAL AND TECHNICAL
Summary of Some Challenges

Socio-Technical:
Collaboration is harder than it should be:
   - File size, time zones, single editor tools
   - The process of clipping and managing clips is onerous and difficult.

Social/Cultural:
Legality – fear of takedown orders.
Retention of the history (old vids on tape or taken down from streaming sites)
Ao3vidders is not formally affiliated with OTW or AO3 in any manner. We are merely participants, members, supporters hoping to spread awareness and generate support for an upcoming AO3 vidding project and the OTW in general.

Sign ups for the VIDDING AUCTION to benefit OTW will commence on May 1st!

AO3's FIRST VIDDER AUCTION - SCHEDULE OF EVENTS

Table of Contents

1. Introduction
2. Benefits of Supporting OTW
3.idding Project Overview
4. Sign Up Details
5. Auction Program
6. Contact Information

Archive of Our Own (BETA rev. 2596)
A project of the Organization For Transformative Works

Be part of our open beta!

SIGN UP NOW

The Archive of Our Own is a fan-created, fan-run, non-profit, noncommercial archive for transformative fanworks.
Ongoing legal Advocacy by the OTW for fair use of vidding...

Salinger v. Colting

- [Amicus Brief, Salinger v. Colting](PDF); served on August 3, 2009.

The Organization For Transformative Works was asked to collaborate with the [American Library Association](American%20Library%20Association), the [Association of Research Libraries](Association%20of%20Research%20Libraries), the [Association of College and Research Libraries](Association%20of%20College%20and%20Research%20Libraries), and the [Right to Write Fund](Right%20to%20Write%20Fund) on an amicus brief in the pending Salinger/60 Years Later case. The OTW's Rebecca Tushnet and Casey Fiesler collaborated with lawyers from Stanford's Center for the Internet and Society and the UC Berkeley School of Law to produce the brief.

Petition to the Copyright Office in favor of a DMCA exemption for makers of noncommercial remix

- [Comment of the Electronic Frontier Foundation](PDF, or view as HTML); submitted December 2, 2008.

The EFF applied to the Library of Congress for a DMCA exemption to allow the extraction of clips from a DVD for inclusion in noncommercial remix videos, such as fanvids, that are found to be fair use. The OTW (and many vidders) assisted in the preparation of this application.

- [Reply Comment of the Organization of Transformative Works](PDF, or view as HTML) in support of the EFF's proposed DMCA exemption for vidders and other remix artists; submitted February 2, 2009.

The Organization For Transformative Works has submitted a reply comment in support of the EFF's proposed DMCA exemption for vidders and other noncommercial remix video artists.
This is where I stopped talking – I did add a few appendix charts in case the issues came up. I also have a ton more data from the 2 surveys, which I will eventually aggregate and make archivable/reviewable.

If you want to get in touch with me about this, I’m reachable at lynn@ghostweather.com.
Growth of LJ comms over 4 years…

Watchers on LJ Communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>amv</td>
<td>474</td>
<td>893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vidding</td>
<td>876</td>
<td>1555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the_reel</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vividcon</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fan_vids</td>
<td>396</td>
<td>1092</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2006

Watchers of 5 communities on LJ: 4 vidding, one AMV

This is without trimming the "leaves" who are people only connected to one community.
In 2010

A giant mess, let’s move on…

This is before I realized I needed to do more helpful graph analysis 😊
# Other Common Fannish Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>% respondents doing them now</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participate in online communities related to vidding</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read fan fiction (just under half write it, too)</td>
<td>81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edit/review fan works by others</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attend fan cons (run by fans for fans)</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One person in the talk asked if vidders do fanfic, or other fan activities. Yes.
Most make 2-6 vids a year.

Time required is the biggest issue most face, and would be a reason for “quitting”.
Mostly live action vidders in this data set – it did not attract or reach many amv folks, but other folks are better positioned for that community than I am.
First “Vid”

Kandy Fong’s Slide Show

http://www.blip.tv/file/2288657
More techie/geeky, less sociable than their friends.

(self-perception)